

5 Auburn Street RFP - Comparison Matrix - 13 December 2022

		Grace Gable Manoirs, LLC	Metro West Collaborative Development	M Trask, Inc.	Natick Affordable Housing Trust
· 2.1 Quality and number of references as a Purchaser in both public and private contexts.		No specific details provided.	Proposer has extensive experience with completing similar projects to the one proposed in the response.	Proposer has extensive experience with completing similar projects to the one proposed in the response. XX references provided, including both public and private contexts.	No specific details provided.
· 2.2 Proposed re-use of the Auburn Street Property.					
o Preserves the existing structure to the extent feasible, with minimal changes to the existing massing, footprint, and exterior appearance (in particular, the appearance of the façade facing Eliot Street)	Proposal notes intent to renovate existing building.	Proposal states that the existing structure will remain and be rehabilitated into housing and community space. Site will also accommodate new construction towards the southwest portion of the lot. Facade facing Eliot Street intends to be retained/rehabilitated as part of the project.	Proposal notes that the existing structure will remain with primarily interior renovations. New construction on site includes 2 structures for housing.	Proposal notes that the existing structure will remain with primarily interior renovations. Final details are to be determined given approach of applicant to issue an RFP for site redevelopment	
o Is respectful of the historic attributes of the existing Auburn Street Property.	No specific details provided. Proposer notes intent to retain and preserve existing building.	Facade facing Eliot Street intends to be retained/rehabilitated as part of the project. New construction is proposed for the back portion of the lot, which is less visible to Eliot Street. Open space at the front of the lot along Eliot will experience limited/no impact.	Proposal includes the renovation of existing historic structures as well as new construction on site. Project seeks to renovate existing structure into market rate housing.	Conceptual project is desired to be contained within the existing structure, with limited new construction on site. Project seeks to retain historic structure on site.	
o Proposed use maximizes the amount and quality of open space on the Property, especially the open space along Eliot Street.	No specific details provided.	Proposed new construction remains on southwest portion of the lot, preserving the open space along Eliot Street.	Site proposes to utilize the existing open spaces for construction of new buildings as part of the development proposal. Pockets of open space, including along Eliot Street, will be preserved.	Conceptual project desires to maximize the open space on site. Final details are unknown given redevelopment approach.	
o Proposed use serves community needs or promotes a public service, such as affordable housing, civic space, arts & cultural amenities, educational facilities, recreational amenities (such as public access to the Charles River from the site), and/or other such uses as may be proposed.	Proposed use is for a school for Autistic population	Proposed use is for the creation of affordable housing. Proposal mentions construction of a privately owned public path to the Charles River for a new vantage point.	Proposed use is for market rate housing with a proposed payment to the Affordable Housing Trust fund. Proposal mentions gifting back a portion of the open space to the Town or putting under a conservation restriction - allowing for future town use and river access.	Proposed use is entirely for the creation of affordable housing	
o Proposed use furthers the goals of the Natick 2030+ Comprehensive Master Plan.	The proposed use is not mentioned within the Natick 2030+ Master Plan as an identified need within the community	Details provided by the applicant. Creation of affordable housing and creation of housing options is a specified goal of the Natick 2030+ Master Plan.	Details provided by the applicant. Creation of housing options is a goal of the Natick 2030+ master plan	No details provided by proposer. However, creation of affordable housing and creation of housing options is a specified goal of the Natick 2030+ Master Plan	
2.3 Ability to Execute Highly Advantageous Proposal features:					
o Proposer presents a clear, concise, and realistic budget and financing plan which describes the proposed source(s) of sufficient funds to purchase the site and complete the proposed improvements thereto.	No details provided	Extensive detail provided regarding the proposed project, in a clear and concise manner. Budget and financing plan is realistic and the proposed sources of funds are consistent with similar projects completed within the Commonwealth.	Detailed budget and financing plan provided. Applicant has extensive experience with similar projects.	Limited details provided. Proposes to reissue an RFP	
o Proposer's financing plan describes the schedule, process, requirements, and approvals needed to secure all public and private funding required to complete the proposed project.	No details provided.	Extensive detail provided regarding the proposed project, in a clear and concise manner. Budget and financing plan is realistic and the proposed sources of funds are consistent with similar projects completed within the Commonwealth.	Detailed financing plan provided with outline of funding approach for the project	No details provided	

	o Proposed schedule is realistic and implements the proposed improvements in a reasonable length of time.	No details provided.	Proposer provides a realistic schedule for financing, approvals and construction. Proposer has significant experience permitting and financing similar projects within the region, but not specifically Natick.	Proposer provides a realistic schedule for financing, permitting, approvals and construction. Proponent has significant experience permitting and financing similar projects in the region and Natick.	Proposer provides conceptual details, however, since the proposal includes the reissuance of an RFP, details are unable to be verified
	o Proposed Project does not need to be rezoned at Town Meeting to be completed, but may require relief from a Town Board or Commission (e.g., a variance from the Zoning Board of Appeals).	No details provided. Based on details provided, use may be considered a Dover Amendment protected educational use under MGL and may be permitted under current zoning bylaws subject to a required Site Plan Review before the Planning Board.	Zoning analysis for the project by the proposer may not be consistent with Natick zoning bylaws. However, proposal could be permitted through a Comprehensive Permit (40B) process.	Project appears to be fully compliant with zoning, requires no zoning amendments, and may require a Special Permit from the Planning Board	Conceptual proposal appears to be fully compliant with zoning, requiring no zoning amendments. Depending on final project details, a Special Permit before the Planning Board may be required.
	o Proposer demonstrates sufficient experience in projects similar to the Proposer's submitted plan and has assembled a team with experience to complete the Proposed Project.	No details provided.	Proposer has significant experience permitting and financing similar projects within the region, but not specifically Natick.	Proposer notes their experience with designing, permitting, financing and completing similar projects in the region and Natick	N/A - Proposer does not intend to be the developer of the project.